

POLICE ADVISORY AND REVIEW COMMITTEE MINUTES

Chairperson Rosa Mar called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. on January 24, 2019 at the Knox County Public Defender's Office, 1101 Liberty Street, Knoxville, Tennessee.

Attending Committee: Rosa Mar, Robert Gibson, Ann Barker, LaKenya Middlebrook, Robbie Arrington

Not Attending: Frank Shanklin, Jered Croom

Attending PARC Staff: Clarence L. Vaughn, III, PARC Executive Director, Ola Blackmon-McBride, Executive Assistant

Attending KPD/City of Knoxville Staff: Deputy Chief Kenny Miller, Deputy Chief Ronald Green, Captain Anthony Willis, Captain David Powell, Lieutenant Jerry Armstrong, Sergeant Jonathan Chadwell, Sergeant Shane Watson, Attorney Ronald Mills, Deborah Thomas, & Avice Reid, Sr. Director of Community Relations

INTRODUCTION

Chairperson Rosa Mar provided thanks to the Knox County Public Defender's Office under the leadership of Mr. Mark Stephens for hosting the 4th Quarter PARC Meeting.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Chairperson Mar asked if committee members had reviewed information discussed during the 3rd Quarter meeting held on October 25, 2018 at the South Knoxville Community Center. There were no changes. The 3rd Quarter meeting minutes were approved.

SPEAKING ENGAGEMENTS & EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT – Clarence Vaughn

Executive Director Vaughn gave a report of the 4th Quarter speaking engagements and Executive Director's report.

SPEAKING ENGAGEMENTS

- October 3, 2018** During the 24th Annual National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement, the Executive Director served as a panelist and facilitator on the discussion of "Law Enforcement and Homelessness". The remaining panelist consisted of Andrew Greenwood, Chief of Police for the Berkeley Police Department, and Kirsten Anderson, Community Law Advisor.
- October 21, 2018** The Executive Director served as a panelist for the post-screening discussion about the highly acclaimed movie entitled "The Hate U Give". The Center for Children and Young Adults served as event hosts, and presented a panel discussion about systemic racism and marginalized communities relationships with law enforcement.
- October 27, 2018** The Executive Director served as a guest speaker for the 100 Black Men of Knoxville mentee discussion which was related to effective ways to engage with law enforcement. Meeting attendees took part in a discussion regarding perceptions of law enforcement and ways in which young African-American males can build relationships with the law enforcement community.
- December 14, 2018** The Executive Director was invited to serve as a guest speaker during the "Real Talk" engagement session held at Norwood Elementary. Students partook of a discussion regarding rules and righteousness. The students were provided with information of ways to abide by laws and understand regulations.
- December 19, 2018** The Executive Director served as a guest speaker for the Eastport and Lee Williams Neighborhood Association meeting. The meeting topic was centered on neighborhood safety and providing of information regarding services offered by PARC.

Attendees were reminded everyone that if anyone would like PARC to speak to his or her organization, please call Clarence Vaughn at the PARC office. The PARC office telephone number is 865-215-3869 and it can also be found in the Informational Brochure located at the entrance table.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR’S REPORT

AUDIT OF DISCIPLINE PROCESS

The Committee audits all completed investigations from the Internal Affairs Unit of the Knoxville Police Department. The results of the fourth quarter audits were as follows:

Total of Cases Audited by the Police Advisory and Review Committee were (4) Referral Action Forms:

Officers Disciplined	2
Civilian Employees Disciplined	0

<u>Disciplines Imposed</u>	<u>Number of Officers</u>	<u>Number of Civilian Employees</u>
Verbal Counseling	2	

The Police Advisory and Review Committee and the Executive Director concurred with Internal Affairs’ conclusions on each case reviewed. The Executive Director asked for additional information on two of the four cases reviewed. After reviewing the additional information provided, the Committee concurred with the findings of the Internal Affairs Unit.

AUDITS OF KPD POLICIES AND PROCEDURES

Reviewed the following ordinances, policies, and procedures as result of the Executive Director’s evaluation of the Internal Affairs Investigations and complaints brought to the Executive Director:

- General Order 1.36 (Harassment)
- General Order 1.60 (Response to Resistance)
- General Order 1.41 (Bias Based Policing)
- General Order 2.16 (Digital In-Car Recording Equipment)
- General Order 3.9 (Traffic Enforcement)
- General Order 4.6 (Criminal Investigations)
- Standard Operating Procedure 1.02 (Neglect of Duty)
- Standard Operating Procedure 1.19 (Unbecoming Conduct)
- Standard Operating Procedure 1.23 (Dissemination of Information)
- Standard Operating Procedure 1.24 (Use of Force)
- Standard Operating Procedure 2.04 (Conduct – General)
- Standard Operating Procedure 2.07 (Truthfulness)
- Standard Operating Procedure 3.00 (Conduct Toward the Public)

ADVOCACY (STRENGTHENING THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE CITIZENS AND THE KPD)

- The Executive Director continues to meet with Knoxville Police Department’s Command Staff and Internal Affairs Unit on a regular basis to discuss concerns and best practices that will result in effective ways to improve relationships with community members.
- The Executive Director schedules introductory meetings for PARC interns with the Knoxville Police Department, Tennessee Bureau of Investigation, Federal Bureau of Investigation, Knox County District Attorney’s Office, and Knox County Public Defender’s Office. Interns are afforded with an opportunity to learn more about their fields of

interest and ask questions to leaders in the field of law enforcement.

- The Executive Director along with senior staff of the Knoxville Police Department conducted a mediation session to resolve a citizen's complaint. The mediation session provides an opportunity for the concerned citizen to engage with a Knoxville Police Department senior officer and share their concerns.

COMMUNITY OUTREACH

- The Executive Director continues to meet with citizens and community groups to discuss concerns and complaints to develop plans for helpful resolutions.
- The Executive Director served as a "Principal for A Day" at Austin-East High School. The event was sponsored by Knox County Schools in which community members are given the opportunity to engage with principals throughout Knox County and learn about their institutions success and challenges.
- The Executive Director along with the Office for Neighborhoods held a meeting with members from the Lonsdale Community to discuss areas of concern and ways in which more engagement between community members and the Knoxville Police Department can occur.

NETWORKING

- The Executive Director was contacted by a Hamilton County Commissioner from the City of Chattanooga in regards to sharing information about PARC and Civilian Oversight. The Executive Director along with a representative from the Knoxville Police Department and key community leaders are scheduled to attend a meeting with County Commissioners, City Councilmembers, and the Hamilton County Sheriff to discuss Civilian Oversight and community engagement with law enforcement.
- The Executive Director continues to attend several civic and service organizations monthly meetings to focus on community relations and engagement. In addition, the Executive Director serves as a liaison for issues concerning the Knoxville Police Department and public safety.
- The Executive Director attended the 24th Annual National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement. The conference was held in St. Petersburg, Florida in which Civilian Oversight Practitioners attending from areas throughout the country and abroad. The theme for the conference was titled, "Sustaining Reform. Advancing Justice".

Chairperson Mar reminded everyone that if they wished to speak at the meeting tonight during "Open Forum" to please sign up on the green sheet located at the sign-in table.

PARC SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS

Audio/Video Subcommittee – Robert Gibson

Of the (4) Referral Action Forms reviewed by the PARC Audio/Video Subcommittee in the 4th Quarter, we submit the provided findings:

File #1 Referral Action Form

The officer's dashboard camera and audio equipment operated properly. The reviewed Referral Action Form involved dispatch wireless and in-car audio and visual recordings relating to the officer's involvement in the incident. The reviewed audio and visual recordings provided further detail into the initial complaint received.

File #2 Referral Action Form

The Referral Action Form reviewed involved the incident occurring a significant distance away from the officer's patrol vehicle. Therefore, the incident was not able to be recorded. The incident took place at Chilhowee Park, which caused for insufficient access to audio/video recordings.

File #3 Referral Action Form

The officer involved in the Referral Action Form reviewed properly activated his wireless microphone, and the officer’s dashboard camera functioned correctly. The incident was recorded in its entirety, which allowed for a comprehensive review of the filed complaint.

File #4 Referral Action Form

In review of the Referral Action Form, the Knoxville Police Department noted having issues with retrieving the officer’s audio and video recording of the incident. A service ticket was provided to the Technical Support Engineer, whom was unable to locate video log file.

SUMMARY

The Knoxville Police Department’s General Order 2.16 (Digital In-Car Recording Equipment) details that Officers shall turn on their audio and video equipment when they are out of their patrol unit on a call-for-service in the event audio is needed to substantiate or assist with documentation of their law enforcement duties, i.e., domestic disturbance, etc. It should be remembered that the purpose of the in-car video equipment is to monitor all contacts with a person in the community in all situations possible.

We would also like to mention that the Knoxville Police Department requires Sergeants to review officers’ audio and visual footage twice per month to ensure that their wireless microphones are operating properly.

RACIAL PROFILING SUBCOMMITTEE – LaKenya Middlebrook

There was one alleged racial profiling case received by PARC during the 3rd Quarter.

Case #1 Summary:

PARC received a citizen complaint in reference to a traffic stop that took place on August 10th, 2018, involving an officer of the Knoxville Police Department. The complainant was driving in a school zone near Green Magnet School, and he was stopped for driving 36mph in a 20mph zone. The complainant alleged that other vehicles were traveling at the same rate of speed, yet his vehicle was targeted by the officer. The complainant felt as though he was racially profiled due to the type of vehicle he was driving and the information stated on his front license plate (Black/Proud/Educated). The complaint is directed to the officer’s questioning in regards to the complainant’s ownership of his vehicle, a 2013 Toyota Tundra pickup truck. The complainant stated that he was asked on more than one occasion if he was the owner of the vehicle, yet he stated that the officer did not request to view the vehicle registration. The complainant provided his driver’s license and proof of insurance to the officer, and he received a citation for speeding in an identified school zone.

Conclusion:

The information presented by the complainant involved an alleged case of racial profiling by a Knoxville Police Department officer. After further review of the issued citation, the conclusion resulted in the officer’s actions being in accordance with the Knoxville Police Department’s policy and procedure. The notion of Bias Based Policing and Racial Profiling are very serious allegations, yet the involved officer was not identified as showcasing signs of blatant bias or racial undertones towards the complainant. Therefore, the allegations against the involved officer did not support a violation of the Knoxville Police Department’s *General Order 1.41 (Bias Based Policing)*.

KPD Policy and Procedure Reviewed:

General Order 1.41 Bias Based Policing

I. Policy

It is the policy of the Knoxville Police Department that we are committed to preserving the peace and maintaining order in the City of Knoxville by practicing bias-free policing and respecting the rights and dignity of all citizens.

II. Definition

Bias Based Profiling - The practice of stopping, detaining or searching a person based solely upon a common trait or a group that includes but is not limited to their race, color ethnicity, age, gender sexual orientation, religion, economic status or any other identifiable group characteristic.

Operations Subcommittee

Quarter-to-Date Operations Report

Ms. Ann Barker reported on the quarterly totals of the 2018 cases, received, and reviewed by the Police Advisory and Review Committee, covering the period **October 1, 2018 to December 31, 2018**.

Total Cases for the Quarter	21
Cases Closed in the Quarter	21
Resolution of Cases Closed for the Quarter	
Executive Director	11
Mediation: Executive Director & KPD	0
Referrals to Appropriate Agencies	3
KPD	7
Executive Assistant	0
Executive Assistant & KPD	0
Total Cases Pending for the Quarter	
PARC <i>Initiated</i> Cases Referred to IAU for the Quarter	
IAU Completed Cases Reviewed by PARC for the Quarter	0
IAU Referral Action Forms Reviewed by PARC for the Quarter	4
PARC <i>Initiated</i> Cases sent to IAU	0
IAU <i>Initiated</i> Referrals and Cases	0

Year-to-Date Operations Report

Mr. Robbie Arrington reported on the year to date totals on cases reviewed by the Police Advisory and Review Committee, covering the period of **January 1, 2018 through December 31, 2018**.

Total Cases for the Year	85
Cases Closed for the Year	87*
Resolution of Cases Closed for the Year	
Executive Director	49
Mediation: Executive Director & KPD	4
Referrals to Appropriate Agencies	12
KPD	22
Total Cases Resolved	87*
Total Cases Pending	
PARC <i>Initiated</i> Cases Referred to IAU for the Year	
IAU Completed Cases Reviewed by PARC for the Year	9
IAU Completed Referral Action Forms Reviewed by PARC	6
IAU <i>Initiated</i> Referrals and Cases	0

*Indicates that 2 cases from 2017 have been closed in the current year

PARC TRAINING SESSION: “Do’s and Don’ts During a Traffic Stop” – Sgt. Shane Watson, Knoxville Police Department

Sgt. Watson provided tips on the “Do’s and Don’ts during a traffic stop. Tips included placing your hands where they are visible, don’t argue, comply with the officer’s requests, etc. If incident occurs at night, he encouraged you to turn your dome light on. He noted that the officer is trained to look at the person’s hand, position themselves to give them a better view of the situation. He asked for a volunteer from the audience and demonstrated a role play that utilized the tips provided. Sgt. Watson responded to several questions from the audience regarding actual and hypothetical scenarios.

CASE MATTERS TO BE ADDRESSED BY THE COMMITTEE

No cases were requested to be addressed.

CITIZENS ASKED TO APPEAR BEFORE PARC

No one requested to appeal before PARC.

OPEN FORUM

Mr. Jim Golden provided the PARC and other representatives a copy of a document addressed to KUB Board of Directors. He thanked PARC for allowing him to speak.

Mr. Rick Roach shared an incident in which he was pulled over by a KPD officer while driving home one night. He believed that the officer did not have a legitimate reason to stop him. He reported that the officer initially said that his tag number did not match the registered car description but later said that was an error. Mr. Roach was encouraged to reach out to PARC if he wanted this incident investigated further.

COMMUNITY UPDATES

Clarence Vaughn shared information regarding the Active Shooter Neighborhood Safety Workshop presented by the City of Knoxville’s Office of Neighborhoods and the Knoxville Police Department. The workshop is scheduled to take place on Thursday, February 28, 2019 at the Civic Coliseum Reception Hall, between the hours of 6:00pm to 8:00pm.

The meeting adjourned

Respectfully Submitted,
Clarence L. Vaughn III, Executive Director